



Lead Safe Child Care Pilot Scope of Work

Table of Contents:

1. Acknowledgement and Context
2. Purpose
3. Scope and Budget
4. Timeline
5. Evaluation Metrics

Acknowledgement: Our community’s child care providers are vital to almost every aspect of our economies and our lives. The work of this pilot is dedicated to making their jobs easier, safer, and more equitable. A majority of the burden of this work, in history, and in the status quo, has fallen on women of color. We humbly join them, and work to build on their legacy. Through this pilot we hope to increase resources and build support for this crucial workforce in our communities.

Context: The Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition was created in 2019 to address the public health crisis of lead poisoning by requiring all rental properties built before 1978 to receive a Lead Safe Certification. Lead is an environmental toxin that affects the brain, heart, bones, kidneys, and nervous system and there are no safe levels once it is in the bloodstream. Lead poisoning occurs when lead builds up in the body, often over months or years, causing serious problems. Unfortunately, many of these problems are not detected until years after exposure. The current system requires a child being poisoned *before* taking action. The Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition, however, is implementing an alternative, preventative approach that not only saves money, but also protects Cleveland’s children from lead poisoning. As Dr. Aparna Bole, a member of the Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition’s Steering Committee says, “the only cure for lead poisoning is prevention”.

The Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition has been building an inclusive and strategic fight against lead poisoning. We have convened community leaders, families impacted by lead poisoning, concerned funders, school nurses, contractors, property owners, residents, and many other stakeholders. Together, this coalition has created a sustainable solution to ensure that Cleveland’s rental units (90% of which were built before 1978) are made lead safe. This took time, care, and the expertise of a myriad of champions in our community. And just as the Coalition was strategic and sensitive to the needs of tenants, property owners, local government, contractors, and everyone impacted in the process, the same care now must be taken in addressing lead poisoning in Child Care settings.

Note: For the purposes of this document, phrases such as “child care facility”, “child care provider” are both intended to mean either a child care center, or a home-based family child care provider (Type A and Type B). When the term “child care industry” is used, it is in reference to a group of providers, likely a mix of center-based child care facilities, as well as home-based child care provider (both Type A and Type B). Type A providers have a maximum capacity of 12 children and Type B providers have a maximum of 6 children under The Ohio Department of Jobs and Families licensing rules.

The child care industry has unique and diverse needs, that have only been exacerbated due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Already strained with narrow profit margins, and disproportionate burdens placed on low-wage-earning women of color, this pandemic has pushed many child care facilities to the brink of closure.

The child care industry is a vast web of small businesses and enterprises with diverse needs. However, lead safe child care, although a different arena than lead safety in homes and rental units, is a critical piece in preventing children from being poisoned by lead. But even beginning to try and understand what lead poisoning in the child care industry could look like raised many questions. How would lead safety be defined within child care? Would the most cost-effective option of interim controls or lead abatement make more sense for this industry? Would that recommendation change depend on the type of facility in question? To gain a clearer, fuller picture of the child care industry, and begin to answer some of these questions, the Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition commissioned a report on lead safety in child care spaces. The report, "[Building the Way to a Healthier Future](#)" written by Groundwork Ohio, outlines where the system stands today, highlights gaps and provides potential remedies and considerations in terms of policy, advocacy, public education, and enforcement.

The Lead Safe Home standard and the interim control curriculum that is being used to bring that standard to rental homes in the City of Cleveland is a starting point for this work. In addition, the State of Ohio Administrative Code, Section 510, states that child care facilities must be "free of lead hazards" as opposed to being 'lead-free'. This pilot will build on these parameters and adapt them for lead safety in child care settings to establish a replicable standard and model for child care across the state, and even the nation.

This pilot is one part of a wide range of investments and support that our child care industry desperately needs. There are deep, systemic, and elevated needs from the child care industry that need to be viewed in context alongside lead poisoning prevention. This pilot is structured to be sensitive to the myriad difficulties facing this industry while also proposing a crucial intervention to address the decades long public health crisis of lead poisoning in Ohio.

When this work began, the Lead Safe Cleveland Coalition was extremely grateful to have the support and expertise of other cities and communities who implemented lead poisoning prevention efforts. It helped us avoid pitfalls and allowed us to build from the work of others. This pilot will not just have all the knowledge the Coalition had at its inception, but also everything we have built since 2019. This pilot will have qualified lead safe workers that have trained by a tried, tested, and vetted curriculum. These are workers who are already robustly engaged in remediating and clearing rental units for the City of Cleveland's Lead Safe Certification. This pilot will have the broader context and knowledge of the Groundwork Ohio report. And most importantly, this pilot will have the invaluable benefit of a coalition that was built by the community, and for the community.

Purpose: To craft and administer a scalable pilot that implements lead-safe interim controls in child care facilities. The pilot will determine an average cost, and assess potential challenges and benefits of a proactive, lead safe approach in the child care industry. The pilot will document feasibility and challenges met along the way to ease the implementation of a bigger, broader lead poisoning prevention effort in child care settings. The pilot will also develop a definition for an applicable lead safety standard in the child care industry.

Scope:

- **Rationale:**
 - Relied on the Groundwork Ohio Child Care Report to understand the context of lead poisoning prevention efforts in child care settings
 - Lead discussions with multiple stakeholder groups to identify budget considerations and areas of risks and challenges
 - Identified the number of facilities to be included in each category of pilot based on existing number of facilities
 - Involved child care providers from an early stage to build trust and build on their existing expertise
- **Methodology**
 - Lead (1) assessment, (2) remediation, and (3) clearance per facility
 - Monitoring how costs vary by facility type and state of the actual facility at hand will help with scalability
 - Professional development and technical education for providers
 - Many providers will be far more motivated to become engaged in lead poisoning prevention efforts if they can earn credits for their education/training efforts
 - Operational support to providers (including stipend and covering loss of income due to remediation work)
 - A lot of remediation work can be done without creating displacement, need to monitor level of disruption, loss of income, or changes in attendance
 - Continuous data collection efforts
 - Will establish standardized quantitative and qualitative metrics to track pilot implementation
 - Pilot Administration + Outreach Materials
 - Some basic materials could include general lead poisoning prevention education, and also provide special assistance to facilities where a unique situation may need to be addressed
- **Pilot Participants Groupings:** The child care industry is not a monolith. Its needs are diverse, and this pilot must be comparably diverse in its methodology and scope. Facilities within the child care industry fall into three (3) main categories. These categories will be implemented with each of the two (2) varieties of lead remediation work that will be assessed in the pilot:

Lead Safe Interim Controls in Child Care Facilities	Lead Safe Interim Controls in Family Child Care (Type A)	Lead Safe Interim Controls in smaller Family Child Care (Type B)	Method of lead remediation work will be multiplied by both number of facilities in each type.
--	---	---	--

Note: Abatement may be evaluated in this pilot through quotes from lead workers.

Budget:

Component of Pilot	Estimated Cost			Totals
	Centers	Family Type A	Family Type B	
Lead Safe: Lead remediation and clearance	\$10,000 x 10 Centers (2 sites at each level of quality per Step Up To Quality rating) \$100,000	\$7,500 x 1 Family Facilities \$7,500	\$7,500 x 9 Family Facilities \$67,500	\$175,000
*31 Lead Assessments for all pre-1978 child care centers and homes in Cleveland (*target is 20 assessments)	\$25,000 maximum			\$25,000
Relocation costs/ Contingency Fund	\$50,000			\$50,000
Professional development and family support	\$50,000			\$50,000
Technical Assistance for children identified with elevated lead levels	\$1,000 - \$1,400 per child based on an average of 12% of children having elevated levels of lead requiring intervention Small – large centers (4-6 classrooms)			\$150,000
Operational support to providers	\$16,500 (15% of remediation cost)			\$16,500
Independent Evaluation	\$30,000			\$30,000
Project Coordinator (PTE)	\$35,000			\$35,000
Pilot administration	\$53,150			\$53,150
Total	\$584,650			\$584,650

Note: Please note the numbers reflected here are estimates that come from an average size of facilities (which we have set at roughly 7,000 sqft for large Child Care Centers, and 1,500 sqft for family run facilities), and an average cost of remediation. These are the best estimates we have right now, and are open to updating with more accurate data.

Glossary of terms:

Relocation costs/contingency fund: In the event that children and staff would be displaced for remediation to occur: coordination of alternative sites and transportation of children; negotiation of terms of conditions for use of alternative space; and improvements to alternative spaces that matches the quality of pilot participants.

Professional development and family support: Provides training to providers on identifying lead hazards, community resources, and maintenance of their facilities after remediation efforts. Family support includes connecting families with information on the adverse effects of lead exposure, lead screening accessibility, and connection to community resources.

Technical Assistance for children identified with elevated lead levels: Recent research has shown that approximately 12% of children have elevated lead levels requiring intervention. For the preschool population, Starting Point’s Special Needs Child Care consultants play a critical role in providing intervention strategies to alleviate the negative impacts elevated levels have on developmental outcomes. Technical assistance provided by eight (8) agencies to address health, development, and social and emotional well-being will be provided to maintain children in their early care and education setting.

- Health – Cuyahoga County Board of Health
- Developmental – Achievement Centers for Children
- Social + Emotional – Applewood Centers, Beech Brook, Hanna Perkins Center for Child Development, Ohio Guidestone, Murtis Taylor, and Positive Education Program

Operational support to providers: In the event that a provider is required to relocate classrooms on-site while remediation occurs.

Project Coordinator (PTE): Manage project infrastructure, recruitment of providers, coordination of site visits and lead assessors/contractors, data collection, communication with providers, marketing, reporting, and resource coordination.

Administration: 10% of total budget to cover accounting, I/T support, data collection and analysis, supervision, communications, and marketing.

	Y1Q1	Y1Q2	Y1Q3	Y1Q4	Y2Q1	Y2Q2
Phase 1						
Discovery: offer lead assesment, develop pilot procedures, raised funds						
Phase 2						
Complete lead remediation in child care facilities						
Complete education with providers and families						
Work with evaluation team to track processes and outcomes						
Phase 3						
Survey participants and gather data to make scalable recommendations about lead safety in child care facilities across Ohio.						
Determine next steps to addressing lead safety needs in city of Cleveland						
	Y1Q1	Y1Q2	Y1Q3	Y1Q4	Y2Q1	Y2Q2

Timeline: 18 months (contingent upon the rates of COVID related cases and its impact on the early care and education industry, including temporary shut-downs due to program-based outbreak and mandatory Legislative shut-downs).

Phase 1:

- Discovery Phase: Offer lead assessments to child care centers and homes built before 1978 in the city of Cleveland free-of-charge to understand the scope of the problem and determine pool of sites for pilot participation. * The facilities that opt into the pilot will be given free assessments. The assessments will be phased to ensure those that are assessed will have access to lead safe remediation resources. This phased approach will be based on funding and remediation will be completed in one batch before moving on to the next.
- Craft pilot iteratively with experts and the input of child care providers, including:
 - Identifying strategies for implementing the pilot in each child care setting, identifying contractors, developing criteria to determine child care provider participants, developing the pilot application process, and crafting the evaluation strategy.

Phase 2:

- Complete lead remediation in child care facilities to make them lead safe
- Complete education with providers regarding lead safe practices.
- Work with evaluation team to track process and outcomes.

Phase 3:

- Survey participants and gather data to make scalable recommendations about lead safety in child care facilities across Ohio.
- Determine next steps to addressing lead safety needs in City of Cleveland.
- Led by independent evaluator, conduct analysis of the pilot's findings and publicly outline any recommendations for scalable, replicable model of lead safety standards in child care. (See below for additional detail)

Evaluation Metrics: We will be monitoring the following metrics listed below. All of the metrics listed will have a considerable impact on the cost, and ability to scale and implement this program in a broader setting.

1. Measure the cost of creating lead safe child care settings
 - a. Cost of lead assessment, remediation work and clearance
 - b. Costs incurred by providers during lead remediation work
2. Type of Child Care Facility and relative impact of pilot on each type of child care provider
3. What level of education and engagement was necessary to make providers interested in the program?
 - a. Level of support and interaction with parents and providers
4. Determine contractor capacity for lead remediation in child care settings, especially when considering a scalable model
5. Develop a definition of a standard of lead safety within child care settings.